



MEMORANDUM

From the Office of the
Township Manager

TO: BOARD OF SUPERVISORS
FROM: CHRISTOPHER BASHORE
RE: BID RESULTS AND POSSIBLE AWARDING OF THE CONTRACT FOR THE BOLMAR STREET CULVERT REPLACEMENT PROJECT
DATE: MARCH 21, 2023

Before the Board of Supervisors this evening are the bid results and a recommendation on the awarding of the contract for the Bolmar Street Culvert Replacement Project. This project was allocated in the 2023 Budget in the American Rescue Fund (line-item #63446-30270). This line-item contains funding for the Township's allocated stormwater projects including, of which this project represents 34% of the allocation.

The bids were opened on February 21, 2023 and five (5) bids were received as follows:

- G&B Construction – \$836,905
- N. Abbonizio Construction, Inc. – \$987,589
- DiRocco Bros., Inc. – \$1,051,514.47
- Road-Con, Inc. – \$1,207,054.50
- Highway Materials, Inc. – \$1,283,972

The apparent low bid from G&B Construction represents a 43% increase over the original cost estimate for the project. Please find attached a recommendation and detailed letter from Christopher Peterson, P.E., of Carroll Engineering Corporation outlining the bid results and analysis. Additionally, Dave Woodward, Public Works Director, and Mark Bertolami, Streets Superintendent, have evaluated the results and provided notes to the Board for consideration. Even with the cost increase, there is adequate fund availability in the American Rescue Fund for this project; however, other projects would need to be re-evaluated. Detailed information on this re-evaluation has been provided for the Board's review. In the alternative, the Board could consider re-bidding the project; however, I agree with Mr. Peterson's that this course of action would not result in a significant reduction in cost and may in fact produce a price increase.

Based on a review of this information, I recommend awarding the contract for the Bolmar Street Culvert Replacement Project to G&B Construction based on their bid of \$836,905 as recommended by Carroll Engineering Corporation in a letter dated March 9, 2023.

Please let me know if you have questions. Thank you.



March 9, 2023

Sent Via email

Chris Bashore, Township Manager
West Goshen Township
1025 Paoli Pike
West Chester, PA 19381

Dear Chris:

Subject: Bolmar Street Culvert Replacement – Letter of Recommendation

This office has reviewed the Bids received by the Township via PennBid on February 21, 2023, for the subject Contract, and a Certified Tabulation of Bids is enclosed for your reference. G&B Construction of Willow Grove, PA, is the apparent low bidder, with a bid in the amount of \$836,905.00. The sum of the improvements associated with the relocation of Aqua’s water main (items 19 through 24) is \$73,400.00, which shall be reimbursed to the Township per the agreement executed on October 3, 2022. The adjusted total for the project deducting the Aqua improvements is \$763,505.00.

The total cost of this project is approximately 43% more than our opinion of probable cost issued to you in October of 2022 in the amount of \$585,000, including the Aqua reimbursement items. A publicly bid construction project can come out higher due to a variety of factors. The cost of materials, labor, equipment and other services have all been on the rise in recent years, making it more expensive to complete a project. Additionally, the dwindling labor force has made it more difficult to find qualified workers to complete projects, causing wages to increase. Finally, the cost of financing has increased, making it more expensive to borrow money for construction projects. These factors have made it particularly challenging to estimate construction projects.

Input from the various contractors during the pre-construction conference and the PennBid questions period indicated that the limited availability and/or longer lead times of the specialized materials required for this project was the primary reason for higher costs. Specialized materials include the 58”x91” elliptical reinforced concrete pipe. We independently contacted several pipe manufacturers for pricing for these materials. We noted that few manufacturers are producing this larger pipe size required for this project, and the costs we obtained were notably higher than what the 2023 RS Means indicates.

Alternates for the elliptical piping required for this project include corrugated metal pipe (CMP) and a pre-cast concrete box culvert. Both options have been ruled out as viable alternatives for this project due to the longevity issues of CMP observed across the Township, and the box culvert is more costly than the elliptical pipe.

Today's Commitment to Tomorrow's Challenges

Corporate Office:
949 Easton Road
Warrington, PA 18976
215.343.5700

630 Freedom Business Center
Third Floor
King of Prussia, PA 19406
610.489.5100

101 Lindenwood Drive
Suite 225
Malvern, PA 19355
484.875.3075

105 Raider Boulevard
Suite 206
Hillsborough, NJ 08844
908.874.7500

Chris Bashore, Township Manager
West Goshen Township
Page 2
March 9, 2023

We also examined the option of reducing the project scope and re-bidding the project. However, there is little scope that can be pulled out of this project without diminishing its benefits. A smaller pipe could be proposed to more closely match the existing 60-inch diameter steel pipe being replaced. However, this area is already known to flood during heavy rainfall, so similar pipe sizing is not anticipated to improve this condition. Furthermore, the various other elements of the project, such as the utility relocations, guide rail installation, and crosswalk realignment, are required to facilitate the installation of the new culvert and improve pedestrian safety at this location.

As such, rebidding this project with a similar or somewhat reduced scope is not anticipated to significantly reduce the cost. In fact, it is common to have a rebid project result in higher pricing from contractors who are acutely aware of the price differences between their competitors from the first bid and will now have had to go through the exercise of estimating and bidding the project a second time, increasing their administrative costs. Furthermore, inflation will likely continue to be a problem in the future.

G&B Construction's bid conforms to all conditions of the Advertisement for Bids. Additionally, CEC has contacted several of their references for projects of similar scope and received positive feedback. Based on their input, we conclude that the low-bid contractor will be able to complete the project successfully. Assuming adequate funding is available, we recommend that the Township award the Contract to G&B Construction in the amount of \$836,905.00.

If you have any questions or require additional information, please contact this office.

Very truly yours,

CARROLL ENGINEERING CORPORATION

Christopher A. Peterson

Christopher A. Peterson, P.E.

CAP:cam

Enclosure

cc: William N. Malin, P.E., Vice President, CEC

Tabulation of Bids
West Goshen Township
West Goshen Township Bolmar Street Culvert Replacement
Bid Date: February 21, 2023
5 Bids Received

					G&B Construction 632 Davisville Rd Willow Grove, PA 19090		N. Abbonizio Contractors, Inc. 250 Conshohocken Rd Conshohocken, PA 19428		DiRocco Bros., Inc. 509 Maple Ave West Chester, PA 19380		Road-Con, Inc. 902 Camaro Run Drive West Chester, PA 19380		Highway Materials, Inc. 409 Stenton Ave Flourtown, PA 19031		Average
Bid Security					10% Bid Bond		10% Bid Bond		10% Bid Bond		10% Bid Bond		10% Bid Bond		
Item No.	Type	Item Description	Units	Quantity	Unit Price	Total Price	Unit Price	Total Price	Unit Price	Total Price	Unit Price	Total Price	Unit Price	Total Price	
1	BASE	Site Clearing/Tree Removals	LS	1	\$4,500.00	\$4,500.00	\$45,910.00	\$45,910.00	\$31,275.00	\$31,275.00	\$35,000.00	\$35,000.00	\$79,700.00	\$79,700.00	\$39,277.00
2	BASE	Temporary Construction Safety Fencing	LS	1	\$6,500.00	\$6,500.00	\$2,700.00	\$2,700.00	\$6,000.00	\$6,000.00	\$3,000.00	\$3,000.00	\$7,165.00	\$7,165.00	\$5,073.00
3	BASE	Erosion and Sediment Controls	LS	1	\$12,500.00	\$12,500.00	\$745.00	\$745.00	\$5,232.50	\$5,232.50	\$10,700.00	\$10,700.00	\$40,295.00	\$40,295.00	\$13,894.50
4	BASE	Bypass Pumping	LS	1	\$19,500.00	\$19,500.00	\$45,000.00	\$45,000.00	\$37,100.00	\$37,100.00	\$175,000.00	\$175,000.00	\$28,300.00	\$28,300.00	\$60,980.00
5	BASE	Detour Implementation, Stop Bar Relocation, Temporary Crosswalk	LS	1	\$16,856.00	\$16,856.00	\$7,315.00	\$7,315.00	\$9,315.00	\$9,315.00	\$10,000.00	\$10,000.00	\$8,850.00	\$8,850.00	\$10,467.20
6	BASE	Miscellaneous Site Removals/Demolition	LS	1	\$3,500.00	\$3,500.00	\$9,770.00	\$9,770.00	\$19,650.00	\$19,650.00	\$9,900.00	\$9,900.00	\$33,450.00	\$33,450.00	\$15,254.00
7	BASE	Removal and Reinstallation of Solar Pedestrian Flashing Warning Device w/Concrete Base	EA	2	\$1,000.00	\$2,000.00	\$4,835.00	\$9,670.00	\$2,500.00	\$5,000.00	\$7,700.00	\$15,400.00	\$9,760.00	\$19,520.00	\$10,318.00
8	BASE	58"x91" Elliptical Reinforced Concrete Slip Joint Pipe	LF	100	\$2,300.00	\$230,000.00	\$2,163.00	\$216,300.00	\$2,537.00	\$253,700.00	\$3,000.00	\$300,000.00	\$1,959.00	\$195,900.00	\$239,180.00
9	BASE	Concrete Endwall (Upstream)	LS	1	\$75,000.00	\$75,000.00	\$118,000.00	\$118,000.00	\$168,000.00	\$168,000.00	\$88,000.00	\$88,000.00	\$127,640.00	\$127,640.00	\$115,328.00
10	BASE	Concrete Endwall (Downstream)	LS	1	\$75,000.00	\$75,000.00	\$132,000.00	\$132,000.00	\$168,000.00	\$168,000.00	\$90,000.00	\$90,000.00	\$138,495.00	\$138,495.00	\$120,699.00
11	BASE	2'x2' Type 'M' Storm Inlet with frame and grate	EA	1	\$7,500.00	\$7,500.00	\$2,640.00	\$2,640.00	\$2,500.00	\$2,500.00	\$5,700.00	\$5,700.00	\$5,690.00	\$5,690.00	\$4,806.00
12	BASE	12"Ø High-Density Polyethylene Storm Sewer w/Suitable Backfill	LF	14	\$400.00	\$5,600.00	\$141.00	\$1,974.00	\$65.00	\$910.00	\$250.00	\$3,500.00	\$450.00	\$6,300.00	\$3,656.80
13	BASE	R-6 Rip Rap Placement, 30" Depth w/ Grouting	SY	140	\$321.00	\$44,940.00	\$395.00	\$55,300.00	\$398.57	\$55,799.80	\$220.00	\$30,800.00	\$520.00	\$72,800.00	\$51,927.96
14	BASE	R-3 Rip Rap Placement, 6" Depth w/Geotextile Fabric Underlayment	SY	30	\$100.00	\$3,000.00	\$65.00	\$1,950.00	\$110.00	\$3,300.00	\$140.00	\$4,200.00	\$182.50	\$5,475.00	\$3,585.00
15	BASE	12"Ø Ductile Iron Pipe Sanitary Sewer w/Crushed Aggregate Backfill - Sanitary Relocation Item	LF	106	\$400.00	\$42,400.00	\$450.00	\$47,700.00	\$332.12	\$35,204.72	\$575.00	\$60,950.00	\$923.00	\$97,838.00	\$56,818.54
16	BASE	Doghouse Sanitary Sewer Manhole with frame and grate - Sanitary Relocation Item	EA	2	\$7,500.00	\$15,000.00	\$14,325.00	\$28,650.00	\$15,000.00	\$30,000.00	\$25,000.00	\$50,000.00	\$17,543.00	\$35,086.00	\$31,747.20
17	BASE	Standard Sanitary Sewer Manhole with frame and grate - Sanitary Relocation Item	EA	1	\$12,500.00	\$12,500.00	\$7,500.00	\$7,500.00	\$10,000.00	\$10,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$15,203.00	\$15,203.00	\$12,040.60
18	BASE	Concrete Encasement - Sanitary Relocation Item	LF	30	\$50.00	\$1,500.00	\$160.00	\$4,800.00	\$165.00	\$4,950.00	\$130.00	\$3,900.00	\$250.00	\$7,500.00	\$4,530.00
19	BASE	12"Ø Ductile Iron Pipe Water Main w/Crushed Aggregate Backfill - AQUA to reimburse	LF	105	\$400.00	\$42,000.00	\$413.00	\$43,365.00	\$291.52	\$30,609.60	\$450.00	\$47,250.00	\$990.60	\$104,013.00	\$53,447.52
20	BASE	12" Ductile Iron 45-Degree Bend w/ thrust restraint - AQUA to reimburse	EA	8	\$1,500.00	\$12,000.00	\$3,000.00	\$24,000.00	\$1,200.00	\$9,600.00	\$3,700.00	\$29,600.00	\$5,360.00	\$42,880.00	\$23,616.00
21	BASE	12" Ductile Iron Tee w/ Thrust Restraint & End Cap - AQUA to reimburse	EA	2	\$1,500.00	\$3,000.00	\$5,100.00	\$10,200.00	\$2,500.00	\$5,000.00	\$6,000.00	\$12,000.00	\$6,151.00	\$12,302.00	\$8,500.40
22	BASE	12" Gate Valve - AQUA to reimburse	EA	4	\$2,500.00	\$10,000.00	\$6,685.00	\$26,740.00	\$5,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$9,000.00	\$36,000.00	\$6,503.00	\$26,012.00	\$23,750.40
23	BASE	12" PVC to Ductile Iron Pipe Restraint - AQUA to reimburse	EA	2	\$1,950.00	\$3,900.00	\$1,650.00	\$3,300.00	\$1,000.00	\$2,000.00	\$2,100.00	\$4,200.00	\$2,525.00	\$5,050.00	\$3,690.00
24	BASE	20" Steel Casing Pipe - AQUA to reimburse	LF	50	\$50.00	\$2,500.00	\$437.00	\$21,850.00	\$500.00	\$25,000.00	\$750.00	\$37,500.00	\$931.00	\$46,550.00	\$26,680.00
Sum of Aqua Improvements (Items 19 thru 24)						\$73,400.00		\$129,455.00		\$92,209.60		\$166,550.00		\$236,807.00	\$139,684.32
25	BASE	Temporary Roadway Pavement Restoration	SY	300	\$9.00	\$2,700.00	\$19.00	\$5,700.00	\$25.00	\$7,500.00	\$31.00	\$9,300.00	\$21.20	\$6,360.00	\$6,312.00
26	BASE	Permanent Roadway Base Course Restoration	SY	365	\$90.00	\$32,850.00	\$57.00	\$20,805.00	\$47.94	\$17,498.10	\$80.00	\$29,200.00	\$67.00	\$24,455.00	\$24,961.62
27	BASE	Roadway Milling and Wearing Course Overlay	SY	575	\$72.00	\$41,400.00	\$22.00	\$12,650.00	\$33.85	\$19,463.75	\$46.00	\$26,450.00	\$39.60	\$22,770.00	\$24,546.75

					G&B Construction 632 Davisville Rd Willow Grove, PA 19090		N. Abbonizio Contractors, Inc. 250 Conshohocken Rd Conshohocken, PA 19428		DiRocco Bros., Inc. 509 Maple Ave West Chester, PA 19380		Road-Con, Inc. 902 Camaro Run Drive West Chester, PA 19380		Highway Materials, Inc. 409 Stenton Ave Flourtown, PA 19031		Average
Bid Security					10% Bid Bond		10% Bid Bond		10% Bid Bond		10% Bid Bond		10% Bid Bond		
Item No.	Type	Item Description	Units	Quantity	Unit Price	Total Price	Unit Price	Total Price	Unit Price	Total Price	Unit Price	Total Price	Unit Price	Total Price	
28	BASE	Bituminous Walking Trail	SY	41	\$150.00	\$6,150.00	\$180.00	\$7,380.00	\$110.00	\$4,510.00	\$110.00	\$4,510.00	\$116.00	\$4,756.00	\$5,461.20
29	BASE	Guide Rail	LS	1	\$64,123.00	\$64,123.00	\$38,880.00	\$38,880.00	\$37,000.00	\$37,000.00	\$26,000.00	\$26,000.00	\$23,990.00	\$23,990.00	\$37,998.60
30	BASE	6' Chainlink Fence w/ Barbed Wire	LF	60	\$200.00	\$12,000.00	\$80.00	\$4,800.00	\$88.00	\$5,280.00	\$110.00	\$6,600.00	\$98.50	\$5,910.00	\$6,918.00
31	BASE	4' Chainlink Fence	LF	91	\$150.00	\$13,650.00	\$56.00	\$5,096.00	\$63.00	\$5,733.00	\$75.00	\$6,825.00	\$70.80	\$6,442.80	\$7,549.36
32	BASE	Concrete Curb	LF	15	\$125.00	\$1,875.00	\$230.00	\$3,450.00	\$215.00	\$3,225.00	\$370.00	\$5,550.00	\$353.00	\$5,295.00	\$3,879.00
33	BASE	Concrete Sidewalk	SF	87	\$25.00	\$2,175.00	\$67.00	\$5,829.00	\$55.00	\$4,785.00	\$70.00	\$6,090.00	\$84.00	\$7,308.00	\$5,237.40
34	BASE	Hot Thermoplastic Crosswalk Pavement Markings	LS	1	\$120.00	\$120.00	\$1,200.00	\$1,200.00	\$2,250.00	\$2,250.00	\$1,200.00	\$1,200.00	\$1,143.00	\$1,143.00	\$1,182.60
35	BASE	Hot Thermoplastic 4" Double Yellow Line Pavement Markings	LF	172	\$6.00	\$1,032.00	\$5.00	\$860.00	\$4.00	\$688.00	\$4.75	\$817.00	\$4.60	\$791.20	\$837.64
36	BASE	Hot Thermoplastic 4" Single White Line Pavement Markings	LF	278	\$3.00	\$834.00	\$2.50	\$695.00	\$2.50	\$695.00	\$2.50	\$695.00	\$2.50	\$695.00	\$722.80
37	BASE	24" Wide White Hot Thermoplastic Stop Bar	LF	15	\$20.00	\$300.00	\$15.00	\$225.00	\$16.00	\$240.00	\$14.50	\$217.50	\$13.80	\$207.00	\$237.90
38	BASE	Finish Grading and Seeding	LS	1	\$6,500.00	\$6,500.00	\$12,640.00	\$12,640.00	\$4,500.00	\$4,500.00	\$6,000.00	\$6,000.00	\$11,835.00	\$11,835.00	\$8,295.00
TOTAL BID less Aqua Reimbursement Items 19 through 24						\$763,505.00		\$858,134.00		\$959,304.87		\$1,040,504.50		\$1,047,165.00	\$933,722.67
TOTAL BID						\$836,905.00		\$987,589.00		\$1,051,514.47		\$1,207,054.50		\$1,283,972.00	\$1,073,406.99

LIGHT GREEN = Lowest price for that particular item.
RED = A high price for that particular item.

"We certify the above to be a true and accurate Tabulation of Bids received on February 21, 2023 by West Goshen Township for the Bolmar Street Culvert Replacement"

Christopher Peterson
CARROLL ENGINEERING CORPORATION
Christopher A. Peterson, P.E.